



MEETING MINUTES
July 16 & 17, 2018
Canaan Valley Resort Lodge
Elm and Willow Meeting Rooms
8:30 a.m.

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Jeremy Blackshire (Proxy)	Mountwest Community and Technical College
Verne Britton	West Virginia Network for Educational Telecomputing
Darryl Clausell	West Virginia Northern Community College
Thom Conner	BridgeValley Community and Technical College
Anita Davis	Pierpont Community and Technical College
Michelle Lang (Proxy)	Glenville State College
Chris Gray	Southern Community and Technical College
David Hays	West Virginia State University
Katherine Hetzer (Proxy)	Marshall University
Becky Miller	Fairmont State University
Amy Pitzer	Concord University
Jessica Porter	WVU – Institute of Technology
Shirley Robinson	West Virginia University
Scottie Samples	WVU – Potomac State College
Barbara Sanders	West Virginia School of Osteopathic Medicine
Carrie Watters	West Virginia Higher Education Policy Commission

MEMBERS ABSENT

(EXCUSED) Jayne Angle – Shepherd University
Daniel Frost – Bluefield State College
Pamela Shrader – Eastern WV Community and Technical College
Janene Seacrist – Community and Technical College System of WV
Michael Caplinger – WVU-Parkersburg
Bob Wise – West Liberty University

(UNEXCUSED) Diane Blady – Blue Ridge Community and Technical College
Vacant – New River Community and Technical College

GUESTS:

Ken Harbaugh	Emeritus
Bob Long	Emeritus

Monday, July 16, 2018**1.) CALL TO ORDER, ESTABLISH A QUORUM FOR RETREAT; 8:30am**

- Amy Pitzer, Chair, called the meeting to order at 8:30 am.
- ACCE extended retreat meeting invitations to Delegate Paul Espinosa (R-Jefferson), WV State Legislature; Patricia "Trish" Humphries (Clay), Vice Chancellor for Human Resources, and Bruce Cottrill, Director of Classification and Compensation, for the West Virginia Higher Education Policy Commission and the Community and Technical College System of West Virginia.
- Delegate Espinosa was unable attend due to conflict of work commitments.
- Patricia Humphries and Bruce Cottrill unable to attend due to temporary travel restrictions until Carolyn Long, the new interim chancellor, begins duties at the WV HEPC, the following week, on Monday, July 23, 2018.
- In the past, WV HEPC former chancellor, Paul Hill, has mentioned that part of interim duties includes meeting with constituency groups.

2.) MINUTES

- a. Review of draft June minutes. Discussion of corrections, clarifications, and other edits.
- b. Motion to approve with any necessary corrections, made by Thom Conner, seconded by Becky Miller. Motion carried.

3.) DISCUSSION OF RECENT EVENTS IN WV HIGHER ED

- a. **WV Higher Education Policy Commission (HEPC) Meeting - June 22**
 - Carrie Waters presented updates on ACCE, committees, main focus to promote value of ACCE and willing to push for higher education funding designated source. Several meeting attendees seemed surprised regarding the work being done our committees are currently working on. Mentioned the Vaughn ruling of 1989.
 - Faculty representatives traveling from across the state, expressed their concerns in the changing of tenure policies, as well as, the power of the institutional Board of Governors (BOGs) to change rules, especially Reduction-in-Force (RIF) policies.
 - James Daily, member of the HEPC, proposes more subsidizes for international students, by lowering tuition rates, given better dorms/housing on campus.
 - HEPC staff, commissioners, and WVU representatives discuss out-of-state students in the funding model.
 - Two different teacher union representatives attended the meeting, but did not speak or present formally to the HEPC group. The commissioners are attempting to remove higher education out of the heightened cash management regulations. HEPC is working with our delegates and

senators, as well as making pleas directly to Betsy DeVos, U.S. Secretary of Education.

- HEPC members discussed, at great lengths, about the program approvals, the upcoming new master plan (including new attainment goals, this will be worked on more at the Student Success Summit), and annual reauthorization [*of four-year degree-granting institutions?*]
- HEPC received a grant from the Lumina Foundation to establish and implement the new attainment goal. The commissioners viewed this as a new development, although, the last two master plans included an attainment goal.
- The way reports are collected is under investigation to see if there may be a better way.
- HEPC members discussed about how enrollment increases over the next few years will not come from graduating HS students, but to work more to recruit the population in WV that have some college, but no degree.
- HEPC members want to simplify the way capital projects are requested and approved, using the example of West Liberty's new soccer and track complex.
- Patricia Humphries, VC of HR, discussed the required state code changes in the rule about 401A retirement plan documents.
- HEPC members approved institutional operating budgets. ACCE should review and examine these operating budgets. These reports indicate one institution had only single-digit cash on hand for operating costs. The report contains charts on operating budgets and current funds available for each institution, beginning on page 106.
- HEPC received approximately 1500 emails with comments regarding the proposed funding model. WV HEPC plan to produce a document including all substantive comments. Chris Treadway, Director of Research and Analysis of the WV HEPC, indicated comments on the funding model would be a 1,500 page document. LOCEA, Legislative Oversight Commission on Education Accountability, indicated the \$13.5 million implementation price tag would be somewhat of a bargain.
- HEPC is currently working on a funding model for the community & technical colleges (CTCs) and medical schools.
- HEPC repealed series 8, 15, 27, 39, and 53. Series 7 approved as an emergency rule.
- HEPC proposed Series 4, 54, and 59 are all out for public comment.

b. Proposed Funding Models

- Delegate Espinoza and Senator Mitch Carmichael (R - Jackson) argument on funding model – primarily to help in-state students. WVU has more out of state students, loses \$9 million in state funding, which is perceived as a penalty, but really is not, because the state should not subsidized or seek to fund out of state students.
- 4-year and 2-year schools; basic principal is the same, source of funding and budgeting for higher education has not changed.

- Current funding model has not been fair to all parties.
- Most of the time, the winners and losers are the same.
- New model touches WVU for the first time.
- Discussion on major factor of decoupling higher education funding from state legislature general budget. Funding is one pool of money. When you create a new system of community colleges, money pool funding did not expand, only contracted. State legislature balances state budget on the higher education; legislature knows colleges can just raise student tuition. Higher costs passed on to student consumer. Must be drastic changes to fix decoupling.
- Funding model discussion spurred other discussions, new Blue Ribbon Commission.
- LOCEA – asked to put a “hold harmless” clause for 3 years before funding model goes into effect.
- Glenville – impact of funding model due to Second Chance Pell (SCP) for state facilities, such as, Pruntytown Correctional Center (PCC), Salem Correctional Center (SCC), etc. [NOTE: FCI Gilmer and Huttonsville Correctional Facility currently listed on the Glenville State College website.]

c. Blue Ribbon Commission (BRC)

- Refer to Gov. Justice recent press release.
- Why announce a new Blue Ribbon Commission one day before the official release of the National Center for Higher Education Management Systems (NCHEMS) report of “*Sustaining Public Higher Education Services in Every Region of West Virginia*” containing completed research and recommendations?
- Gov. Justice may possibly attempt restructuring of higher education by executive order. However, this action is prohibited by the WV state constitution. The state constitution clearly delineates duties of the legislature, executive, and judicial branches of government. Four-year institutions also oppose restructuring higher education.
- BRC hasn’t met yet, first meeting this Wednesday [BRC later rescheduled for July 27, meeting held at the Bridgeport Conference Center].
- BRC has very short amount of time for research and report to Gov. Justice, by December 2018 deadline. BRC has the same objective as NCHEMS that worked on this project for the past 1 ½ years to complete research and report.
- BRC’s 20 members are all four-year institutions, no community colleges represented.
- Sarah Tucker, Chancellor of the Community & Technical College System of West Virginia, has goal to create a truly, unified CTC system in the state. However, some community college presidents oppose a unified system and refuse to answer to Chancellor of a CTCS.
- Discussion of successful state-wide community college systems: North Carolina CTC & Kentucky CTC examples. However, these systems have centralized most of the business office responsibilities, such as: account

receivable, accounts payable, human resources, temporary & adjunct contracts, payroll and other functions.

- Discussion on what to do with the Career & Technical Education (CTEs) K12 schools. Competition for adult students, however, some partnerships exist for specific programs with community colleges. CTEs underfunded and understaffed.

[NOTE: Link to all of the CTE centers in the state of WV

<http://careertech.k12.wv.us/about.html> in the following categories:

- **22 County CTE Centers** - stand-alone centers, such as, MTEC in Morgantown;
 - **7 Multi-County Centers** - shared centers, such as, the Calhoun-Gilmer Career Center;
 - **45 Comprehensive High Schools** – offering 5 or more career cluster, these are high schools have CTEs within the school facilities, such as, Grafton High School; and
 - **7 Specialized CTE Facilities.**
 - Additionally, there are **52 High Schools** - offering less than 5 career clusters, without a CTE center.]
- Recent Charleston Gazette-Mail articles and editorials on regarding the issues of how higher education is structured in WV:
 - o 6/29/18 Section C “Justice to Create Commission on 4 year college in WV”
 - o 7/3/18 Section A “Higher Ed Panel Setup”
 - o 7/3/18 Section A “Entrepreneurism now on curriculum at CTCs”
 - o 7/4/18 Section A “Merging Bluefield, Concord, Glenville, WVSU Boards”
 - o 7/6/18 Section D “Academic Competition Will Strengthen WV”
 - o 7/8/18 Section B “College Presidents Suggest Keeping Hill”
 - o 7/10/18 Section A “Schools in Fight for Lives”
 - o 7/11/18 Section A, “Tech’s Long Heads HEPC”
 - o 7/12/18 Section A “WV’s Regional Colleges Are Right to be Worried”
 - o 7/13/18 Section A “Takeover WVU, Everyone Else”
 - o 7/13/18 Section A “Who Could Have Predicted ‘Out-of-Control’ Higher Education System”
 - Discussion of potential impact of BRC on higher education employees. Staff jobs on the line. Faculty jobs are also on the line, but most did not realize this until too late Section 8, HB2542 affecting their freedoms would be taken away, now is law.
 - BRC inconsistency among members; some were told they were just to make recommendations; others told they report directly to governor.

d. National Center for Higher Education Management Systems (NCHEMS) Report

- Report of “Sustaining Public Higher Education Services in Every Region of West Virginia”
- Commissioned by state legislature.

- Declining enrollment, state legislature cuts in funding higher education.
 - Lists negative effects of the state government’s decisions to separate community colleges from public 4-year schools, weaken the power of the HEPC, decentralize governance and cut higher education funding.
 - Recommends combining the governing boards of Bluefield State College, Concord University, Glenville State College and West Virginia State University.
- e. Switch of Classified to Non-Classified Status** [*NOTE: Additional agenda item.*]
- Across institutions, communication and implementation of new paygrade schedule have been inconsistent and resulting in multiple issues for employees.
 - Disparity of comp and benefits as side-effects of switching classified staff to non-classified staff employees. For example, a situation of disparity in vacation accrual of job positions with the same duties, responsibilities: 3 finance jobs, current 2 classified staff have not reached 15 years of service to achieve 2 days’ vacation accrual per month, new finance employee, non-classified, receiving 2 days accrual.
 - Discussion on legislative code and grandfather clause that any new employees after July 1, 2017 will be hired as non-classified.
- f. Performance Evaluation System / Pay-for-Performance, Merit-Based Pay** [*NOTE: Additional agenda item.*]
- ACCE has previously identified problem areas and issues with the performance management system. HEPC needs to have “teeth” for accountability for performance management systems. State code keeps referencing best practices, but best practices are not defined at all.
 - Example of WV DOP version of performance appraisal system, in 3 phases over the course of 12 months, but WV DOP no longer grants raises based on performance evaluations.
 - If merit-based pay, or pay for performance, a broken evaluation system is unfair. Institutions’ performance-based reviews should be standardized, objective without bias, employee review template. Every employee, including president, vice presidents, should have a performance review. HB2542 removes requirement for performance review accountability by HEPC.
 - ACCE has requested HEPC to provide clarification on best practices, however, no answers other than, “institutions should know what best practices to use for their employees.” Actually, a definitive answer is based on *industry best practices and evidence-supported outcomes as best practice*, such as, the College and University Professional Association for Human Resources (CUPA-HR).
 - No longer can use case law argument precedent, such as, Vaughn Ruling 1989, because now it is law that every institution can do something

different. Point factor methodology still in legal code, no institution or HEPC will address it.

4.) COMMITTEE REPORTS and WORK SESSIONS

- a. **Benefits** – (Barbara, Thom, Jessica, Darryl, Michael, Scottie, & Dee)
Committee information, update the charge on the ACCE website, “the benefits committee provides info related to updates and changes to employee benefits.” Members need to be updated. Have member names hyperlinked to their pages. Info for you: include links to PEIA, TIAA CREF, Mountaineer Flex, HealthSmart, and CVS/caremark. Checked PEIA taskforce, gathering data, still holding subcommittee meetings
- b. **Legislative** – (Amy, Carrie, Michael, Anita, Verne, Frosty, Chris, Jessica, & Shirley) Create specific talking points for legislative representatives. Revise mission statement and include on any ACCE materials. Continue to work on documents. List contributions and accomplishments of ACCE. Add links on ACCE website to WV State Legislature, DOL employment laws, etc. Establish 4 month timeline. Should ACCE send another letter to the education chairs? Last letter sent to education chairs 2010/2011.
- c. **Website /Communications** – (Verne, David, Carrie, & Shirley)
Verne presented the updates to ACCE website. New info windows popup with contact info with each college ACCE rep, their classified chair, & BOG rep. David volunteers with the graphic design of the contacts presented on the websites. Suggestion to add ACCE member photos, need uniformity in portraits David – working on rough drafts ACCE website redesign that would be more user-friendly and appealing.
- d. **Student Advocacy** – (Anita, Jessica, Becky, & Darryl)
Student Retention, Student Success, DegreeWorks. Assessment of core transfer lists, TES, articulation agreements that students are actually receiving college credits as intended, or, if credits accepted just as elective credits (initiative by Paul Hill, former chancellor of HEPC). Address issue of misinformation being distributed to high school students and college students. Financial aid vs. funding model - Keep tuition from increasing, value of grants. Expected Family Contribution (EFC) levels, if greater than \$11,000, then don't qualify for. What, exactly, is “student access” – definition varies among institutions and state government agencies. ACT Plan test for 11th graders is not the national SATs not federal ACT to SAT; low scores in Math and Science. [*CORRECTION: ACT Plan was the national exam, but is no longer used for 11th graders.*] SAT stopped counting against for wrong answers, is now allowing more students to qualify for PROMISE scholarships. Best practices of reaching students through social media, be aware of changing trends of popularity: Twitter, **especially Instagram, SnapChat,**

YouTube. All the schools need to use these platforms instead of just college website.

- e. **Retreat** – (Becky, Shirley, Sheri, & Jessica) TBD, location state park. Possibly add leadership conference, invite all BOG reps, chairs, and council members for training.

CALL TO BREAK FOR 1st DAY OF RETREAT.

Motion to adjourn for the evening, made by Scottie Samples, seconded by Carrie Watters. Motion carried and meeting adjourned at 5:00pm.

Tuesday, July 17, 2018

CALL TO ORDER, ESTABLISH A QUORUM FOR 2nd DAY OF RETREAT; 8:30am

Amy Pitzer, Chair, called the meeting to order at 8:30am

5.) CONTINUED DISCUSSION OF STAFF COUNCIL/ADVISORY COUNCIL CHANGES IN STATE CODE

- Reviewed and discussed draft of proposed changes to advisory council for possible vote at a future meeting of ACCE.
- Work on possible proposed legislation wording. Must also review definitions contained in Article that may change.
- Discussion of proposed revisions to state code.
- Legal Name and Operational Name [*NOTE: operational is the name abbreviation, the "hereto referred as"*] must be consistent throughout the article document.
 - Grammar, structure, commas, formatting;
 - Final editing until content revisions are decide; and
 - Must finish code revision first, vote in August to take action.
- General discussion on role and charge of such an entity – will ACCE stay the same or change?
 - Argument relative to institution's interpretation
 - Possible formula to determine category representation – There may be some schools with a bunch of people in one category and none in other categories. How can we make it a more fair process for representation? It's more like electing delegates, rather than senator models, which would be more effective for CTCs.
- Justification for requesting code update/change of ACCE to the state legislature.
 - Obviously, because recent code changes have affected higher education employees.

- However, once code is open to changes, anything can happen, expected and unexpected outcomes.
- ACCE has been independent in the past. Will the president and executive councils allow us, as non-classified, to continue our mission since 1986?
- Fear that the presidents will clamp down, no other voices of diversity in assisting and educating legislatures, this role is for executive staff only, thus destroying ACCE's ability to improve employee system overall. Lack of input from higher education faculty, students, staff on legislative boards has destroyed impact on policy making and legislative acts if we cannot speak freely.
- ACCE was the first to take the initiative of supporting all of higher education within the state of WV, rather than promoting single institutions in the legislature.

6.) WEBSITE WORK SESSION AND ASSIGNMENTS

Agenda item moved to August meeting due to HEPC Interim Chancellor Carolyn Long conference call with ACCE. In the meantime, committee chairs obtain login and access to change the ACCE website or submit changes

7.) ACCE BY-LAWS REVIEW and POSSIBLE RECOMMENDATED CHANGES

Agenda item moved to August.

8.) CALENDAR FOR 2018-2019 MEETINGS

In consideration of the institutional calendars, meetings of the HEPC & CTCS, WV State Legislature & Interim Meetings, and other events, the following dates and locations are set for the ACCE meeting schedule of 2018-2019:

1. Wednesday, August 29 – WV HEPC, Charleston
2. Monday, September 24 – Marshall University, Huntington
3. Monday, October 22 – WVSOM, Lewisburg
4. Thursday, November 15 – Fairmont State University
5. Wednesday, December 12 – MUGC, South Charleston
6. Tuesday, January 29 – MUGC (*Jan 28, Higher Ed Day at the Legislature*)
7. Tuesday, February 12 – WVSU, Institute (or MUGC)
8. Friday, March 8 – MUGC, South Charleston (*March 9, last day of Legislature*)
9. Thursday, April 25 – WVU Potomac State College, Keyser
10. Monday, May 20 – Southern WV Community & Technical College (Logan or Williamson, location TBD)
11. Tuesday, June 18 – WVU Parkersburg
12. Monday, July 22 & Tuesday, July 23 Retreat – TBD state park

9.) INTERIM CHANCELLOR CAROLYN LONG - CONFERENCE CALL VIA CELL PHONE

[NOTE: Additional agenda item.]

- Introduction by Carolyn Long (Chancellor). Understands challenges of small schools. Will try very best to earn your trust. Work with commission to do what's best for all of the schools and every student coming into college. Doesn't have a lot of the answers yet, because the Commission has not met yet. Still have lots to hear from the commission members.
- Goals – find a way to make all of our smaller colleges bigger and better.
- The Chancellor plans to meet with every president on their campuses in the next few weeks. Also, she plans to meet with ACCE representatives and constituency groups.
- The Chancellor expressed her appreciation of the staff's continued work on meeting and assisting students.
- Chair Amy Pitzer invited Chancellor Long to meet with ACCE during our next meeting, on August 29. The Chancellor planned to meet with ACCE in Charleston.
- Chair Amy Pitzer thanked Chancellor Long for her time and expressed ACCE's willingness to help in any way possible.

10.) CAMPUS CONCERNS, ANNOUNCEMENTS, ETC.

- Chair, program managers/coordinators not available for summer time, due to being 9, 10, or 11 month employees. Hurts enrollment because parents now have the time to visit campus, meet, and have more specific questions requiring in-depth answers of specific academic programs. Summer is the time where students and parents are looking more closely at degree programs and colleges.
- FSU is taking away faculty stipends. Faculty no longer responding to emails and phone messages during the summer break between spring and fall semesters.
- WVU glitch of not taking out medical insurance during the summer pay for 10 month employees. WVU trying to resolve, possible fixed by August.
- Incremental pay increases and the increment check both changed to end of July, get in ARREARS.
 - o WVU Tech notified they will receive increment in July 27.
 - o WVNCC & Southern CTC pay increment set for August instead of July. However, Southern may have received unclear communication from the college's HR department.
 - o There is nothing in code regarding the incremental pay raises for higher education employees.
 - o At this time, FSU employees have not received official notification on raises or increments. Rumors of 3% but won't make a decision until they actually receive appropriations. Entire Personnel policy being repealed and replaced to make staff all non-classified; comment period ended yesterday, staff voted no and faculty voted no. New

- employee manual repealed with no new replacement, so no procedures in place.
 - Mountwest CTC board just approved 3% across the board. President presented his draft on unified staff policy. Staff offered to help with writing policy, however, president said he would listen to our input.
- WVSU – David Hays met with President Jenkins, discussed grandfather clause, president didn't know anything about it and would check into it. President only knew of progressive discipline policy. President Jenkins' interpretation/view is that not much will change once all staff switch to non-classified status. Policy regarding the switch of staff to non-classified is out for public comment. President Jenkins is open to meeting with staff.
- Ken Harbaugh noted state code says funding received by colleges, that colleges should fund ACCE and classified staff council representation. Legislative code doesn't specify which budget, only that ACCE will be funded.
 - David has researched WVSU budget for ACCE, discovered budget reduction to \$500; president will fix this issue. The reason for reduction? Most of the past ACCE meetings were local so he didn't "spend out" on the allocated travel budget for ACCE.
- Bob Long commented that institutions and organizations are always questioning the purpose of entering provisional items into state code; institutions have a clear history of differing interpretations. In 2006, legislation was passed to conduct a study on higher education personnel; Dennis Taylor created the committee for this research and report on higher education. The results that institutions are not complying with their own policies. If funding is not designated in code for ACCE and staff representation, then institutions will direct funding elsewhere instead of state-intended purposes.

10.) ACCE ELECTIONS

In accordance with WV State code and by-laws of ACCE, ACCE shall meet in the month of July to elect officers for the positions of Chair, Vice Chair & Secretary.

- a. Bob Long volunteered to serve as teller. Tellers shall distribute, collect, count the ballots and report the voting results to the ACCE members.
- b. Nominations are opened to the floor for the position of Chair of ACCE:
 - Thom Connor nominated Amy Pitzer, seconded by Becky. Nomination accepted by Amy.
 - Call for any other nominations for Chair, none received.
 - Motion to close nominations for Chair, made by Shirley Robinson, seconded by Carrie Watters. Motioned carried.
 - Motion to accept Amy Pitzer as Chair by acclamation, for the July 2018 – July 2019 term, made by Chris Gray, seconded by Carrie Watters. Motion carried.
- c. Nominations are opened to the floor for the position of Vice Chair of ACCE:

- Becky Miller nominates Carrie Watters, seconded by Thom Connor. Nomination accepted by Carrie.
- Call for any other nominations for Vice Chair, none received.
- Motion to close nominations for Vice Chair, made by Thom Connor, seconded by Dave Hays.
- Motion to accept Carrie Watters as Vice Chair by acclamation, for the July 2018 – July 2019, made by Chris Gray, seconded by Becky Miller. Motion carried.
- d. Nominations are opened to the floor for the position of Secretary of ACCE
 - Dave Hays nominates Anita Davis, seconded by Chris Gray. Nomination accepted by Anita.
 - Call for any other nominations for Secretary.
 - Jessica Porter nominates Dave Hays, seconded by Thom Connor. Nomination accepted by Dave.
 - Motion to close nomination for Secretary and vote by ballot, made by Carrie Watters, seconded by Becky Miller.
 - Move to vote by ballot.
 - All present members voted by ballot.
 - Ballot votes counted by Bob Long
 - Anita voted for Secretary July 2018-July 2019
 - Jessica Porter and Dave Hays volunteered as alternative substitutes for secretary.

11.) ADJOURNMENT

Motion to adjourn, made by Scottie Samples, seconded by David Hays. Motion carried.
Meeting adjourned at 2:00pm.

Next ACCE meeting scheduled for Wednesday, August 29 – WV HEPC in Charleston, WV.

Respectfully submitted,

Anita Davis, substituting for the ACCE Secretary