



MEETING MINUTES

September 24, 2018
Memorial Student Center, John Spotts Room
Marshall University, Huntington, WV
9:00 a.m.

MEMBERS PRESENT

Jayne Angle	Shepherd University
Dee Preston	Mountwest Community and Technical College
Verne Britton	West Virginia Network for Educational Telecomputing
Michael Caplinger	WVU-Parkersburg
Anita Davis	Pierpont Community and Technical College
Sheri Goff	Glenville State College
Chris Gray	Southern WV Community and Technical College
David Hays	West Virginia State University
Tim Melvin	Marshall University
Becky Miller	Fairmont State University
Lisa Neel	Bluefield State College
Amy Pitzer	Concord University
Jessica Porter	WVU – Institute of Technology
Shirley Robinson	West Virginia University
Scottie Samples	WVU – Potomac State College
Barbara Sanders	West Virginia School of Osteopathic Medicine
Carrie Watters	West Virginia Higher Education Policy Commission

MEMBERS ABSENT

(EXCUSED) Thom Conner – BridgeValley Community and Technical College
Kelly Taber – New River Community and Technical College

(UNEXCUSED) Diane Blady – Blue Ridge Community and Technical College
Darryl Clausell – West Virginia Northern Community College
Tammy Ours – Eastern WV Comm. and Technical College
Janene Seacrist – Comm. and Technical College System of WV
Bob Wise – West Liberty University

GUESTS

Bruce Cottrill	WV Higher Education Policy Commission (HEPC)
Jerome Gilbert	Marshall University
Katherine Hetzer	Marshall University, Staff Council
Bob Long	Emeritus
Carol Hurula	Marshall University, Staff Council/BOG

1.) CALL TO ORDER & ESTABLISH QUORUM

Amy Pitzer, Chair, called the meeting to order at 9:00 am. Welcomed President Gilbert and other guests to this ACCE meeting.

2.) GREETINGS FROM PRESIDENT JEROME GILBERT, MARSHALL UNIVERSITY

President Gilbert thanked ACCE and classified staff for serving as the “front lines” of higher education with students and the public. Interesting time in higher education. Proposed funding to keep local sites of higher education available to many of the students that are geographically constrained. Funding proposal of 14 million back in August (the Gilbert Plan), but did not receive support from everyone.

- Pitzer – thanked President Gilbert for his plan to help smaller schools, because they were not able to make up funding cuts like the bigger institutions.
- David Hays from WVSU asked President Gilbert 2 questions. How was the funding allocation determined in his \$10 million plan for the regional schools from the Metro News story? Is this funding a one-time allocation or a permanent addition to the base budget of those institutions? President Gilbert said he used the original funding model to determine the allocated moneys and that he hoped and intended for that funding to be permanently added to the base budget for those institutions.
- Pitzer – thanked the president for taking the time to implement new salary schedule for a great number of employees.
- Gilbert – Marshall University employees will be at minimum by the end of this year, NOV/DEC.

3.) APPROVAL OF MINUTES

- a. Review of draft August minutes. Discussion of corrections, clarifications, and other edits.
- b. Motion to approve with any necessary corrections, made by Jayne Angle, seconded by Carrie Watters. Motion carried.

4.) COMMITTEE REPORTS/DISCUSSION

- a. **Benefits** – No report at this time. Upcoming PEIA Task Force meeting; task force not meeting deadlines from September, October, or December. How many states have mandated – state health insurance? Out of network providers across state lines not available to employees that live close to state borders. Previous proposed legislation pay differential (currently 80/20) to change to 70/30 did not pass, because Legislators did not have a definitive plan.
- b. **Legislative** – No report at this time. Must develop message for Legislators and go full force, as we are representing this group. Do we have to wait on Blue Ribbon Commission? Must start gathering our comments. Must talk to legislators before upcoming session. What does

the legislature control? What does the HEPC control? Talking points – HB2542 has every institution doing their own thing, which makes it difficult for higher education employees across the state to address and advocate on common concerns and issues.

*[*Note – additional information from Bob Long regarding the importance of voting in the upcoming November general election. In particular, SB439 passed in the 2015 general session and HB2542 passed during the 2017 general session. Each bill had components that addressed higher education personnel and directly affected ACCE membership.*

*In a meeting with Senator Gaunch (R, District 8), who was a co-sponsor of **SB439**, Bob Long & Ken Harbaugh expressed concerns regarding certain provisions in the recently introduced bill. Senator Gaunch indicated he had no knowledge of the bill. Bob & Ken informed him that he was a co-sponsor. Senator Gaunch stated that a staff member had brought him the bill, advised him it was a good bill, and he signed on without knowing what was in the bill. At the conclusion of this meeting, Senator Gaunch confided that our points were valid but that he would have to review the language before coming to judgment. The senator remained a co-sponsor and voted for the bill. The voting results were both appalling and disheartening. The Senate vote was 33 – Yes, 0 - No, 1-Other. The “Other” vote was Senator Beach who was an original co-sponsor but removed his name as a co-sponsor and did not vote on the bill. On the House of Representatives, the vote was equally disturbing as all 100 members voted- Yes. Except for Senator Beach, no other member of either chamber took exception to the bill. Every president, at every public higher education institution, has consistently praised the dedication, value and work ethic of classified employees; however, no legislator or representative chose to advocate for employees in higher education.*

*As for **HB2542**, the meager support of senators in opposing the bill was once again disappointing as **only seven senators voted against this bill**:*

- Rucker (R) 16th District
- Beach (D) 13th District
- Ojeda (D) 7th District
- Facemire (D) 12th District
- Unger (D) 16th District
- Romano (D) 12th District, and
- Jeffries (D) 8th District

*On the House side the support for opposing the bill was both enlightening and encouraging as the vote was 61-Yes, 38-No and 1-Other. The following **delegates voted against the HB2542**:*

*Baldwin (D) 42th District
Evans (D) 26th District
Isner (D) 43th District
Pyles (D) 51th District*

*Barrett (D) 61th District
Ferro (D) 4th District
Longstreth (D) 50th District
Robinson (D) 36th District*

Bates (D) 30th District
 Fleischauer (D) 51th District
 Love (D) 32th District
 Rodighiero (D) 24th District
 Boggs (D) 34th District
 Fluharty (D) 3th District
 Lovejoy (D) 17th District
 Rowe (D) 36th District
 Brewer (D) 13th District
 Folk (R) 63th District
 Lynch (D) 44th District
 Sponaugle (D) 55th District
 Byrd (D) 35th District
 Frich (R) 51th District
 Miley (D) 48th District
 Thompson (D) 19th District

Canestraro (D) 4th District
 Hartman (D) 43th District
 Miller (D) 23th District
 Ward (R) 50th District
 Caputo (D) 50th District
 Hicks (D) 19th District
 Moyer (D) 29th District
 Williams (D) 51th District
 Diserio (D) 2th District
 Hornbuckle (D) 16th District
 Pethel (D) 5th District
 Eldridge (D) 22th District
 Iaquina (D) 48th District
 and
 Pushkin (D) 37th District

These are just two examples of recent legislation important to employees of higher education. Employees must conduct their own due diligence when reviewing the positions of their local candidates. Without major changes in the make-up of the state legislature, we can expect more of the same detrimental action that has occurred over the past several years.]

- c. **Web/Communications** focus on members' page, need photos. Updated page image, no changes to webpage template.
- d. **Student Advocacy** – No report at this time.
- e. **Retreat** – No report at this time. Discussion of potential leadership conference. Unknown at this time due to possible travel restrictions, unknown availability of funding – unable to fund Leadership Conference to bring in new chairs & vice chairs of classified committees, BOG representatives, vice chair, & ACCE rep.
- f. **Ad-hoc By-Laws committee** – No report at this time. Plan to call group together in October. Delegate sections of bylaws for review and update. Shirley Robinson added to this committee.

5.) BRUCE COTTRILL, DIRECTOR OF CLASS AND COMPENSATION, WV HIGHER EDUCATION POLICY COMMISSION (HEPC) AND THE COMMUNITY & TECHNICAL COLLEGE SYSTEM (CTCS) OF WV

Progress by Institutions Update & Annual Market Review Discussion

- Heard more from 4-year than 2-year institutions, except from New River and Northern.
- West Liberty, FSU, HEPC, and Concord already at minimum base pay scale.
- Glenville not yet at minimum, with possibly four employees left to be upgraded.
- Shepherd up to minimum, but not at market
- First, step to get all employees at minimum base pay scale in WV. As they work forward, then institutions can form own policies to move along pay range.

- WVSU not implemented minimum base pay schedule yet, the presidents are still working on rules and policies for their institutions.
- Marshall will be at minimum by the end of this year.
- WVU has moved to open pay ranges for the past six or seven years. WVU is not using the new minimum classified salary schedule. However, WVU has created new salary rules.
- Old pay system had no consistency.
- FSU at minimum salary levels, but when will go to market based pay?
- No institutions have gone beyond minimum salary levels yet across the board.
- WVSU – cannot give some classified staff raises, and others not. Not found in code. Discussed money pool. The institution's comment period on switching classified & non-classified to all-staff, has closed. WVSU has not changed to merit-based pay system yet because the institution wanted to match Gov. Justice proposed raises and implementation process.
- WVU – merit based, but 2% across the board.
- The minimum 5% pay increase only covered employees paid through general revenue. Budgeting for these increases for staff; awarding it on a "schedule" or performance cycle; off-cycle increases, such as hiring for a new, high demand specific position, additional duty increases.
- WVU-P minimum pay goes into effect Oct. 1, 2018.
- All institutions should have a written salary and pay raise policies.
- **Will all institutions report their salary rules to HEPC/CTC?** Not sure if all institutions will report. WVU does their own thing, but still has to report to HEPC on employee status under equitable salary ranges.
- **How can employee salaries increase when 'as funding is available' policy by institutions?** Positions such as physical plant, custodian, are paid only for minimum tasks, not held accountable for anything else.
- No one to blame because no one is responsible for equitable pay; not the legislature, HEPC, or institutions previously. Now institutions are responsible for pay inequity. Some schools have been more accountable, others have not and never will be, held accountable for institution's pay inequity of their employees.
- **What are the talking points to discuss with HR? What are the right questions?** Keep talking to BOG, HR in reviewing institutional policies; make sure CHRO is giving the correct information to employees.
- In the past 15 years, the trend has been to hire positions as non-classified because the classified positions pay is too low for job applicants. A job position is not determined as non-classified status by its reporting duties or budgeting responsibilities.
- The biggest complaints that new non-classified get max vacation when classified had to work for many years to achieve same amount of annual leave.
- In the 2005, the state of Virginia restructured their higher education. Some states use a civil service pay structure, which can be much worse in requiring advanced qualifications (master's degree) while offering only low pay, such as \$28,000 annual salary.
- HEPC will use market pay software – purchase CUPA-HR salary surveys, incumbent pay. Purchase interface of personnel data within wvOASIS, info not available to regular employees, just senior level administrators. All institutions will have access, except WVU.
- If CHROs are computing compa ratios (your salary divided by midpoint) to make decisions on pay. If compa-ratio is way below, then institution should address

pay inequity. Not necessary to contact CHRO now, because of JCC work and that classifications/descriptions are changing, no final description yet.

[Note: *How to Calculate Compa Ratio*

<http://www.hrperformancesolutions.net/blog/compensation-administration-software/compensation-101-get-to-know-compa-ratios>]

- HEPC continues to work on job titles and job descriptions on the Job Classification Committee (JCC).
- **Concerned that performance reviews are inconsistent among supervisor ratings.** Request equity review.
- The problem with salary research of higher education employees from other states is that there is accountability put into place that West Virginia is lacking, mainly reporting. HEPC would like to see more HR information such as turnover rate. Accountability is very important when it comes to Human Resource reporting given that 70% of budgets are typically towards personnel.
- The WV legislature has no requirement to regularly update and fund pay scales. HEPC supposed to review market pay. There is no recourse for institutions to continue to fund pay scales, currently only forced to go to minimum salaries of pay scales.
- The Blue Ribbon Commission (BRC) website containing information on the HEPC duties and responsibilities of HEPC staff members is incomplete and inaccurate. BRC has not made recommendations on the HEPC at this time. What is the recourse on how to correct what HEPC actually does?

6.) BLUE RIBBON COMMISSION (BRC) RECOMMENDATIONS

See website. Review new funding model. Very interesting suggestions, such as including out-of-state students. Taxpayer money for out-of-state students, supposed to fund allocations for in-state students. Whether or not out of state students may remain in WV. New materials available for the first time.

If WV subsidizes out-of-state students, then in-state students carry the burden of increased cost. Counties across the board now have metro fees. When state appropriations decrease, then fees increase for all students. Promise scholarships and need-based aid, which no longer provides enough aid to cover increased tuition costs, nor funded completely by the state budget.

Southern CTC, near to the state border of Kentucky, has approximately 40% out of state students, but has a reciprocity agreement with Kentucky. In other state reciprocity agreements of students, such as Pennsylvania, sends more of their students and state funding to WV than our students going to PA.

Gilbert plan – will not fund loss of revenue. Be careful of funding models, based on stats, such as, Minnesota and Oregon. Other states use the full model, only parts, too draconian because of the state legislatures own requirements – out of state students.

BRC – agenda and minutes on the BRC website do not have many details, meeting duration is short, and most items accomplished through executive session. BRC scheduled to report to LOCEA in December 2018. BRC can only make recommendations. **Ask presidents/CHRO for monthly report on BRC.

- Is it too early to submit formal announcement on ACCE position towards the Blue Ribbon Commission?** Study BRC website.

- b. **Motion for reviewing BRC website and discuss with classified staff council at institutions for input and feedback;** bring talking points to next ACCE meeting, made by Sheri Goff, seconded by Becky Miller. Vote, all aye. Motion carried. Look at funding models for impact on students. What is the best outcome for the student, for the state of WV? Use general lenses of higher education: as a taxpayer, as a parent, as a student.

ACCE should continue to exist as a vital partner in advocating for students and employees in higher education as a whole, not just promoting self-interests of individual institutions.

7.) LEGISLATIVE BROCHURE

Need to create outline. Prioritize issues. Legislative committee. Main worries?

- a. **ACCOUNTABILITY.** This system has no accountability, removed by HB2542, from previous HB439, HB330 that had some type of accountability. Talk about reporting. Legislators who campaigned on accountability platform now do not know what institutions are actually doing. Seventy percent (70%) of an institution's overall budget is personnel. Most senior level administrators are now making double salary of other staff, of which staff pay is not equitable. Additionally, senior administration and supervisors are not allocating adequate resources to staff to do their jobs, and the students are paying for it. Not a big deal for bigger schools, but has a more significant impact on smaller schools. ACCE worked for years to increase HR staffing to get work done for employees; see HB330. No contracts, no PIQs. The legislature failed to take action on previous reports from the institutions. Institutions complained of the amount of reports required and unable to hire staff. In the haste of eliminating reports, legislature got rid of most all reports. Legislature should have removed unnecessary reports and duplicate reports. The Legislature must understand the full impact of what they have done by eliminating reports. Who is responsible for the oversight?
- b. **UPCOMING ISSUE OF SHARED GOVERNANCE.** What is shared governance? Everyone has a different definition of shared governance. For instance, it sometimes means the practice of faculty runs all aspects of academics. Faculty are making shared governance an issue in relation to academics accreditation (Higher Learning Commission). Actually, just input is not enough to be shared governance; staff and faculty must have a seat at the table in the beginning of discussions. See articles related to nursing programs.
- c. **PEIA** – benefits should be a part of this for all employees; also retirement.
- d. **FUNDING MODELS**
- e. **SALARY INCREASES** - Institutions must begin to budget for future pay raises. State allocations for higher education meant for subsidizing in-state student tuition rates, not common practice for pay raises.
- f. Suggestion of including ACCE member directory. In ACF brochure, they include a list of members and their contact information. However, not effective to print brochure with member directory.

8.) ISSUES FOR DISCUSSION IN ANNUAL PRESENTATIONS

Motion to carry these items to next ACCE meeting, by Dave Hays, seconded by Michael Caplinger. Motion carried.

9.) WORK ON ACCE WEBSITE

Committee chairs to submit mission statement and additional information for website.

10.) CAMPUS CONCERNS

Absenteeism and lack of participation of classified staff members at council meetings. In one case, supervisors have prohibited their subordinates from attending meetings. Classified Staff Chair & ACCE representative should approach college president to encourage supervisors to allow meeting participation. To gain more meeting participation, classified staff may be interested in doing more community outreach, raffles, luncheon, and food drives/bagging candy for special events. Ask why members are absent.

WVSU – Discussion over funding for raises. A money pool was discussed; however, code does not allow some classified employees to receive a raise and not others. As a result, it was decided that the funding be divided among all staff as a flat equal amount raise. The comment period for switching from “classified” to “non-classified” has closed. WVSU has not completed the change to the new market pay system because the institution wanted to match Gov. Justice proposed raises and implementation process.

11.) UPCOMING MEETINGS

- a. **ACCE – October 22, hosted by WV School of Osteopathic Medicine, Lewisburg, WV**
- b. **HEPC Meeting – November 16**
- c. **CCTCE Meeting – December 13**

12.) ADJOURN

Motion to adjourn, made by Carrie Watters, seconded by Chris Gray. Motion carried. Meeting adjourned at 3:30pm.

Submitted by,

Anita Davis, ACCE Secretary