



MEETING MINUTES
August 29, 2018
John Hendrickson Conference Center
WV Regional Tech Park
1740 Union Carbide Dr., South Charleston, WV
9:00 a.m.

MEMBERS PRESENT

Jayne Angle	Shepherd University
Dee Preston	Mountwest Community and Technical College
Verne Britton	West Virginia Network for Educational Telecomputing
Darryl Clausell	West Virginia Northern Community College
Thom Conner	BridgeValley Community and Technical College
Anita Davis	Pierpont Community and Technical College
David Hays	West Virginia State University
Tim Melvin	Marshall University
Becky Miller	Fairmont State University
Amy Pitzer	Concord University
Jessica Porter	WVU – Institute of Technology
Shirley Robinson	West Virginia University
Barbara Sanders	West Virginia School of Osteopathic Medicine
Carrie Watters	West Virginia Higher Education Policy Commission

MEMBERS ABSENT

(EXCUSED) Sheri Goff – Glenville State College
Chris Gray – Southern WV Community and Technical College
Scottie Samples – WVU – Potomac State College
Michael Caplinger – WVU-Parkersburg

(UNEXCUSED) Diane Blady – Blue Ridge Community and Technical College
Daniel Frost – Bluefield State College
Tammy Ours – Eastern WV Comm. and Technical College
Janene Seacrist – Comm. and Technical College System of WV
Bob Wise – West Liberty University
Vacant – New River Community and Technical College

GUESTS

Ken Harbaugh	Emeritus
Patricia Humphries	WV Higher Education Policy Commission (HEPC)
Bob Long	Emeritus
Carolyn Long	WV Higher Education Policy Commission (HEPC)
Bruce Cottrill	WV Higher Education Policy Commission (HEPC)

1.) CALL TO ORDER & ESTABLISH QUORUM

Amy Pitzer, Chair, called the meeting to order at 9:00 am.

2.) APPROVAL OF MINUTES

- a. Review of draft July retreat minutes. Discussion of corrections, clarifications, and other edits.
- b. Motion to approve with any necessary corrections, made by Thom Conner, seconded by Becky Miller. Motion carried.

3.) CHANCELLOR CAROLYN LONG

Questions submitted from ACCE members:

- a. **What is your vision for your time at HEPC/What would you hope to accomplish?**
 - Chancellor Long - Here for transition only until the decision is made to hire a permanent chancellor for the HEPC. I'm not planning to be at the HEPC for the long-term.
- b. **What are your thoughts on the proposed funding model?**
 - Chancellor Long – There is no funding model that does not touch or fit the mission of all institutions. Perhaps, the best formula is, no one is happy with the funding model. Shepherd and West Liberty are doing well with finances.
- c. **What are your thoughts on the Blue Ribbon Commission and how will their work differ from what NCHEMS was asked to do?**
 - Chancellor Long – Blue Ribbon Commission (BRC) has charge from state of WV. HEPC will provide any information or data requested by the BRC. NCHEMS had different parameters for their report; it is different from the BRC; does not match in some ways.
- d. **What are your thoughts on institutions making ALL non-teaching employees non-classified?**
 - Every entity has to be heard.
- e. **Do you support the annual market reviews for classified employees as required by State Code and HEPC rule?**
 - Trish may have better answers for you than me. Most entities look at market reviews every 3-5 years.
- f. **Isn't it fair to have an external organization, outside of WV influence, politics, etc. to evaluate higher education and make recommendations without bias?**
 - Chancellor Long – Chris Treadway looked up several funding models from around the country. What would be the best fit for WV? He looked at how much money WV has, based on previous budget allocations. If the legislature does not think it is a fair model, then they would modify. Chris did what he thought was right as some part were acceptable, and some weren't at best practices. The Lumina Foundation looked at formula for fairness.

Their report and recommendations are available on the HEPC website. Lumina had pointed out specific elements of the formula to change before publishing final version of the funding model.

- g. **What are the chances of obtaining additional funding for higher education in the next legislative session?**
- Chancellor Long – It depends on the revenues of state. No one currently serving in the state legislature thinks higher education is not underfunded. However, the legislature will always go after the lower hanging fruit when cutting budgets. Keep in mind the HEPC & BRC are only bodies that can offer suggestions. Only the legislature can make changes.
 - Amy – During my long involvement with ACCE, funding higher ed., as a whole, has always been our priority. ACCE will continue to support funding for higher education. ACCE also has a Student Advocacy committee to advocate on behalf of WV students when at the Legislature.
 - Chancellor Long – The priority is the student, not the institution we work at, or the job position we hold. High school numbers are declining in the state. The bottom line is on the benefits for our students.
- h. **What are your thoughts on the suspended search for the chancellor position?**
- Chancellor Long – I do not expect to be at the HEPC after the legislative session, there has been no discussion yet on what will happen.
- i. **What kind of challenges have you face that you were not expecting?**
- Chancellor Long – I never expected the uproar about me coming from WVU or as president of WVU Tech. If I cannot come in and serve from an internal institution then we should not have a WV resident serve in this capacity. I served as principal at previous K-12 schools, while being superintendent of the same county, there was no concern of favoritism. Biggest challenge of divorcing favoritism, overcoming perception of favoritism. The HEPC staff has been very courteous and cooperative.
 - Jessica shared that at WVU Tech, Chancellor Long always attended classified staff meetings and made herself available to answer questions or concerns staff had. She was also very honest and candid about legislative issues and things going on around campus.
 - Chancellor Long – Brutal honesty is best sometimes. Very proud of moving the campus location from Montgomery to Beckley, never received a grievance, ADA complaint or lawsuit from employees.
- j. Bob – As historian of the group, I've observed three different iterations of restructuring higher ed. in WV. The current HEPC/CTC structure has no power to affect change or enforce accountability on the institutions. Legislature and institutions faced no criticism, lawsuits from failing to

implement changes from 2011 personnel bills. There must be an organization to hold everyone accountable to achieve any goals in higher education. Need some organizations to hold goals and accountability. Now we have 26 silos of everyone doing something different, decreasing resources allocated to higher ed., doing more with less, cannot keep this up. I hope the BRC will consider these issues.

- Chancellor Long – Please address these comments in writing for when the BRC requests input.
- Ken – Concerned BRC has short time, very tight schedule to submit recommendations.
- Chancellor Long – Agreed. HEPC has no control, either, only governor.

No further questions in the meeting session with Chancellor Carolyn Long. On behalf of ACCE, Amy thanked Carolyn for her time and expressed that ACCE stands ready to offer assistance in any way she thinks we could be of help. Chancellor Long expressed her thanks and appreciation for all of the employees in higher education.

4.) COMMITTEE REPORTS/DISCUSSION

- a. **Benefits** – (Barbara, Thom, Jessica, Michael, Scottie, & Dee) subcommittee on funding wants to have their report – Aug. 15 article – complete by October 15, cost revenue of - PEIA task force website. Public outreach, coverage of last meeting. See report. Teachers suggest oil/gas severance tax on PEIA recent editorial. No consensus yet on funding model.
- b. **Legislative** – (Amy, Carrie, Michael, Anita, Verne, Frosty, Chris, Jessica, Jayne & Shirley) discussion on ACCE mission statement in consideration. Advocate for staff; sharing knowledge, actively communicate across the state, as well as being an advocate for our institutions unification, unifying, bridging, etc. Carrie recommended creating a new list of ACCE talking points. Amy discussed revising ACCE's purpose (article 3 of the bylaws) and mission statement.
- c. **Web/Communications** (Verne, David, Carrie, & Shirley) – working on new designs, updated committee listing, as well as, additional agendas and minutes to build archive.
- d. **Student Advocacy** – (Anita, Jessica, Becky, Darryl, & Jayne) HEPC Financial Aid Advisory Board – sets award amount. Students' access to education may improve if financial aid amounts were raised to align with the increasing cost of tuition; rather than the decision of raising the Estimated Family Contribution (EFC) amount to \$11,000.
 - o Valley College (located in Beckley, Princeton, & Martinsburg, WV) – certification program cost of \$30,000. Valley College intentionally changes Classification of Instructional Programs (CIP), disrupting the accuracy of tracking and reporting educational completion to maintain eligibility for financial aid award amounts.

- e. **Retreat** (Becky, Shirley, Sheri, & Jessica, Jayne) – No report at this time.
- f. **Chair appointed ad-hoc By-Laws committee** – The following members will participate in this committee to review and revise the ACCE by-laws: Jessica, Barbara, Carrie, David, Tim, Dee, Becky, & Anita (along with Bob & Ken).

5.) Patricia “Trish” Humphries, Vice Chancellor of Human Resources, and Bruce Cottrill, Director of Class and Compensation, WV Higher Education Policy Commission (HEPC) and the Community & Technical College System (CTCS) of WV

a. Annual Market Review Update

In accordance with 18b-9a-6(f), job and compensation market reviews intended to update minimum salary schedules for employees. If higher education institutions had met compliance to state code regulations, then employees would not be in this situation of suffering a large gap in pay between market and previously established salary schedules. If an institution is not paying the minimum salary schedule, then this institution is in violation of state code. What are the penalties or repercussions to the institution? None. So far, there has been no discussion of maintaining salary schedule updates. Salary schedules, to be fair and equitable, must have an annual review.

- Almost time to review the salary structure and evaluate the implementation process. However, some institutions are not yet at minimum salary levels.
- **Are there legitimate reasons why institutions have not implemented minimum salary levels?** Some institutions may have been confused on the sequence of how to change, if they had to modify their institutions' salary policies first. Turnover of staff at some institutions have slowed the process down. Lots of turmoil in higher education and individual institutions, which has affected the time and process of implementation. Institutions were confused on “chicken before egg” policy change; should our board of governors change salary policy first- or, go forward with new minimum salary ranges, then modify the institutions' written salary policies? HEPC has provided clarification to institutions that still had questions.
- **If an institution makes all employees non-classified, then that institution is exempt from the new classified salary schedule.** However, the identification of pay gaps has demonstrated value of updated market value of all jobs. Some institutions use the new salary schedule as a guide for non-classified salaries, even though there is no way to attach paygrade to non-classified positions. Institutions are not responding to data requests, whether or not required by state code.
- **Are these institutions in violation of 18b when they do not respond, or refuse to respond, to data requests? If so, are there any notifications of violation to the institution?** The HEPC has sent reminders to the institutions, and currently in progress to implement these requests. This section of code gave institutions ability to write

and follow their own policies. Code says institutions are to provide data and forward to the HEPC. The HEPC has not received any employee complaints of code violations.

- WV State University & Marshall are not yet in compliance with the new minimum salary schedules. WVSU's human resources department has been very transparent on the status of progress. Marshall has a target timeframe of July 2019 to have salary schedules fully implemented with staff.
- **If institutions are receiving funds to implement the new minimum salary schedule, but not implementing these required changes, is this being reported to HEPC?** HEPC will receive this information soon from institutions for the upcoming fall report.
- **What if the institutions do not provide this information in the report? What is the next step? FOIA request?** Institutions are currently seeking to have legislation remove all requirements of reporting human resources data to the HEPC. Concord has done excellent job of providing requested information to the HEPC. The past eleven months of the implementation process, has been difficult in raising salaries, automatically, at market pay due to budget issues.
- The HEPC has submitted recommendations to the Blue Ribbon Commission (BRC), on new performance evaluation system, training institutions, best practices, etc.
- **Employee turnover.** Concord has lost three employees to other state agencies who are paying more for the same job responsibilities to other state agencies that are not doing market studies, but are paying the market rate. Higher education cannot compete. This was not an issue when civil service exam was a requirement; some state agencies still require exams. HEPC has asked institutions to report on turnover rates, time of vacancy/hiring process, time to fill-in, etc.

6.) ENHANCING EMPLOYEE ENGAGEMENT (per HB2542)

- Only way to begin to increase employee engagement is to conduct surveys, dive into where the problems are... this impacts student success. Everything in the college environment affects student success; lack of engagement from landscapers, custodians, staff, faculty, etc. can have an effect. Open communication is the common thread and big part of keeping employees engaged.
- **Does the HEPC report to the BRC about the need for oversight of HR for individual institutions, as well as, to include why authority and accountability is necessary for higher education?** Indirectly; no direct communication of requesting oversight authority. HEPC to become a "shared services model." There needs to be a central game plan, not control. HEPC should be referee; i.e. sports analogy.
- **Is there any push back from exempted or non-exempted employees?** Not necessarily, some institutions will work closely with HEPC, ex. WVSOM and West Liberty. HEPC does not have control; the

class and comp system is recognized by almost all institutions. Review of higher education human resources reporting by state code; however, this no longer required. It is possible for Section 9B will result in making institutions conduct internal HR reviews.

- **Upcoming HR report card** on institutions will include information on Reduction in Force (RIF) policies. HR reporting has shifted responsibility from HEPC to governing boards, joint rule; but BOGs will not participate in joint rule. BOGs question: Why do we need to know how many HR personnel? What is our turnover? The solution is to promote that HR reporting is important. Reporting on a five-year cycle is not part of yearly routine, like IPEDS and other higher education reports, so institutions were frustrated on obtaining and reporting data; it was considered as just another state code requirement.
- **wvOASIS** is difficult for HR reporting and budgeting, software programming code driven. wvOASIS was not designed as a function or relational database for cross-referencing information. wvOASIS is table-based, especially PCard reconciliation. The budgeting and HR functions were an afterthought in designing this system. No other software for statewide use and no plans to change/remove wvOASIS. Overall, the wvOASIS database only contains data half of employees in higher education. Marshall and WVU have their own employee management systems, as they do not use wvOASIS for personnel. Currently working to resolve employee concerns of data privacy. Additionally, there are plans to have an interface between wvOASIS and market pay information. wvOASIS opens higher education personnel data to oversight that misinforms on what really we do because of flawed software design. Institutions question the need to report to HEPC, that we already have federal laws, IPEDS, accreditations. Institutions must be accountable to the taxpayers of WV via HEPC. Must have data for data-driven decisions, but institutions will not provide data.
- No one looking at consequences, looking at whole picture, if colleges consolidate, then those local community economies will lose jobs and residents will move elsewhere.
- **What does state code say about making everyone non-classified?** **No answers.** Fairmont State University HR department says RIF policies intended for critical employees. No bumping rights if layoffs, but still retain other property rights of employment.
- **What reason would an institution have to move a custodian from classified status to non-classified employee?** Already had fairness, and other equitable treatment, under classified structure, until HB2542 was passed.
- **What will Blue Ribbon Commission (BRC) members do on personnel issues?** The BRC only requested HR data from HEPC.
- **18B will be wide open for next legislative session. Will HEPC have opportunities for submitting recommendations to the**

legislature? Depends on who introduces the legislation, and if they want HEPC input. Must form connections with those who supports these changes.

- **Burnout.** Amy – As chair of ACCE, staff from many schools will call me for assistance to HR questions. **In particular, employees have questions regarding the increasing work hours and responsibility overloads.** Employees are worried about not being able to 100% effective while wearing so many hats. They are afraid to speak up because many have been switched to non-classified status. Most employees say they are not being compensated for the extra duties. No choice to fill positions. Burnout exempt employees, leaving state, has a negative effect on the state economy. Institutional student services are impacted the most when budgets are cut, positions are not filled, and no one can give 100% to the three jobs they are now doing.
- Employee turnover is not measured by HEPC, or, even by some institutions, however, employees can request increase and review.
- There is a report on staff to student ratios? There is justification on new positions most always, but institutions lack the funding or in some cases, choose to use the funds for other purposes.
- Next HEPC meeting, there will be an open forum for ACCE to report issues of employee burnout, however, difficult in presenting opinions only. Suggestions: include how there is no training on how to do job, HR, leadership, management, people & supervisory skills. Be a voice to the president of your institution. Report concerns and comments of peers, but be positive and go with a solution.

7.) REPORT ON PROGRESS BY INSTITUTIONS

- Update on Funding Model. Recent revision, see Chris Treadway's report on HEPC website [http://www.wvhepc.edu/wp-content/uploads/2018/08/StudentFocusedFunding_Commission_24Aug2018_Rev25Aug2018.pdf]. [*Public comments on funding model also updated http://www.wvhepc.edu/wp-content/uploads/2018/08/HEPC_FundingModelComments_23Aug2018.pdf*]
- Hold-harmless agreement for the state to provide funds that will cover the revenue gap of implementing the new funding models; revised from 3 years to 8 years. Increasing the number of years that the state has to cover budget gaps may be considered as a strong indicator that the funding models are not economically viable or financially feasible for institutions.
- Charleston Gazette-Mail article, Saturday August 25: State Faculty Representative and WVSOM President asked to participate on the BRC; requests denied by the Gov. Jim Justice. [*Previous requests for ACCE representative also denied.*]

- West Virginia Commission Seeks Equity for Colleges. But Behind the Scenes, Gordon Gee Pulls Strings.
<https://www.chronicle.com/article/West-Virginia-Commission-Seeks/244364>
- Governor's previous report showing a large amount of budget surplus is misleading due to state accounting office did not yet have full June 2018 expenditure amounts available.
- Discussion on BRC website, <http://wvblueribbonhighered.org> contains a section open for public comments.
- List of BRC members does not include Chancellor Carolyn Long.
- BRC created by governor executive order, which is violation of state code.
- Dr. Kendra Boggess from Concord University and Dr. Jerome Gilbert from Marshall University supposed to be listed as co-chairs
- Some feel that the BRC is a tactic to remove HEPC's proposed funding models.
- Will both the BRC and HEPC proposals be submitted in the next legislative session?
- FOIA request by Gazette mail on communication of Carolyn Long appointment by Governor Justice.
- Marty Gearhart, from Mercer County, filed lawsuit, Bruce Walker walk-out.
- Patricia Rucker – raised questions, but subdued / redirected when she continued to follow up for answers. Patricia is originally from Venezuela, a public school teacher, had no idea of level of political attacks in WV.

8.) CAMPUS CONCERNS

- What is the process of determining how and where an employee is moved within a salary range? At Concord University, this information can be found on the college website, under => human resources => total rewards. Concord has adopted the HEPC salary guidelines. This document and others can be found at:
<https://www.concord.edu/hr/sites/www.concord.edu.hr/files/files/Sal%20Adm%20Guidelines%207-20-17cla.pdf>
- Classified Staff Councils at each institution should have a chance to review ACCE proposed legislative changes for employee comments and suggestions, in preparation for the start of the next legislative session. Amy – will send out final draft for review once completed

9.) UPCOMING MEETINGS

- a. **ACCE – September 24, hosted by Marshall University**, located on Huntington Campus, John Spotts Room in the Memorial Student Center (parking available in the 6th Avenue Garage)

- b. **HEPC Meeting – November 16**
- c. **CCTCE Meeting – December 13**

10.) ADJOURN

Motion to adjourn, made by Anita Davis, seconded by Carrie Watters. Motion carried. Meeting adjourned at 4:00pm.

Submitted by,

Anita Davis, ACCE Secretary